



High Level Track Policy Sessions

Summary by High Level Track Facilitators

May, 3rd and 4th

Draft, status as of 5th May 2016



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	3
Chairman.....	4
Moderation: High level Track Facilitators (HLTF).....	5
Session ONE: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda	8
Session TWO: Knowledge Societies, Capacity Building and e-Learning.....	12
Session THREE: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda	15
Session FOUR: Inclusiveness – Access to Information and Knowledge for All	18
Session FIVE: Bridging Digital Divides	22
Session SIX: Inclusiveness – Access to Information and Knowledge for All.....	24
Session SEVEN: Enabling Environment	27
Session EIGHT: ICT Applications and Services.....	30
Session NINE: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda; Financing for Development and Role of ICT	31
Session TEN: Digital Economy and Trade.....	34
Session ELEVEN: Bridging Digital Divides	37
Session TWELVE: Enabling Environment; Cybersecurity; Climate Change	40
Session THIRTEEN: Bridging Digital Divides	44
Session FOURTEEN: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda; Financing for Development and Role of ICT	46
Session FIFTEEN: Enabling Environment.....	49
Session SIXTEEN: Media; Cultural Diversity and Heritage, Linguistic Diversity and Local Content; Ethical Dimensions of Information and Knowledge Societies	51



Introduction

High-level Policy Sessions

At the WSIS Forum 2016, moderated High-Level Policy Sessions of the High-level Track (HLT) took place on the 3 and 4 of May. During these sessions, moderated Policy Sessions with high-ranking officials of the WSIS Stakeholder community, representing the Government, Private Sector, Civil Society, Academia and International Organizations were held.

Themes

High-Level Policy Sessions were divided into fifteen sessions covering fourteen themes. The themes, listed below, are based on the Geneva Plan of Action, in particular the WSIS Action Lines, and build on the outcomes of the United Nations Overall Review and the submissions received during the open consultation process.

1. WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda
2. Bridging digital divides
3. Enabling environment
4. Knowledge societies, capacity building and e-learning
5. Financing for development and role of ICT
6. Building confidence and security in the use of ICTs
7. Inclusiveness – access to information and knowledge for all
8. Gender mainstreaming
9. ICT applications and services



10. Digital economy and trade
11. Climate change
12. Media
13. Ethical dimensions of Information and Knowledge Societies
14. Cultural diversity and heritage, linguistic diversity and local content

Chairman







Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda
Deputy Assistant Secretary
Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs
United States of America



Moderation: High level Track Facilitators (HLTF)

All the High-level policy sessions were moderated by High-level Track Facilitators nominated by the different stakeholder types i.e Civil Society, Academia, Private Sector and Technical Community.

<u>Session</u>	<u>Stakeholder type</u>	<u>Name, title, organization and country</u>	
ONE WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda	Academia	Dr. Tomasz Janowski , Head, United Nations University Operating Unit on Policy-Driven Electronic Governance (UNU-EGOV), Portugal	
TWO Knowledge Societies, Capacity Building and e-Learning	Academia	Dr. Shailaja Fennell , Lecturer in Development Studies, Centre of Development Studies and Department of Land Economy, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom	
THREE WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda	Technical Community	Ms. Karen McCabe , Senior Director of Technology Policy and International Affairs, IEEE, USA	
FOUR Inclusiveness – Access to Information and Knowledge for All	Civil Society	Mr. Klaus Stoll , Executive Director, Global Knowledge Partnership, Germany	



FIVE Digital Divides	Bridging	Civil Society	Chinmayi Arun Executive Director Centre for Communication Governance at National Law University Delhi India	
SIX – Access to Information and Knowledge for All	Inclusiveness	Technical Community	Mr. Pablo Hinojosa , Director, Strategic Engagement, APNIC, Australia	
SEVEN Enabling Environment		Civil Society	Ms. Anriette Esterhuysen , Executive director of the Association for Progressive Communications , APC, South Africa	
EIGHT Applications and Services	ICT	Private Sector	Ms. Elizabeth THOMAS-RAYNAUD , Senior Policy Executive and Director, International Chamber of Commerce (ICC), France	
NINE WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda; Financing for Development and Role of ICT		Technical Community	Mr. Nigel Hickson , Vice President, International Governmental Organisations (IGO) Engagement, ICANN, United Kingdom	
TEN Economy and Trade	Digital	Private Sector	Ms. Marilyn Cade , Board Member of WAVE and Advisor to ICT Associations from Developing Countries, USA	



<p>ELEVEN Bridging Divides</p>	<p>Digital</p>	<p>Academia</p>	<p>Mr Greg Shannon, Ph.D, Chief Scientist for the CERT Division Software Engineering Institute at Carnegie Mellon University USA</p> 
<p>TWELVE Enabling Environment; Cybersecurity; Climate Change</p>	<p>Enabling</p>	<p>Technical Community</p>	<p>Ms. Anna Slomovic, Lead Research Scientist, Cyber Security and Privacy Research Institute, George Washington University, USA</p> 
<p>THIRTEEN Bridging Digital Divides</p>	<p>Bridging</p>	<p>Civil Society</p>	<p>Dr. Cisse Kane, President, African Civil Society on the Information Society (ACSIS), Senegal</p> 
<p>FOURTEEN WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda; Financing for Development and Role of ICT</p>	<p>WSIS</p>	<p>Civil Society</p>	<p>Ms. Iffat Gill, Founder/CEO, ChunriChoupaal, The Code to Change, Netherlands</p> 
<p>FIFTEEN Enabling Environment</p>	<p>Enabling</p>	<p>Private Sector</p>	<p>Mr. Frank McCosker, General Manager, Affordable Access & Smart Financing. Microsoft</p> 
<p>SIXTEEN Media; Cultural Diversity and Heritage, Linguistic Diversity and Local Content; Ethical Dimensions of Information and Knowledge Societies</p>	<p>Media;</p>	<p>Private Sector</p>	<p>Ms Lori S. Schulman, Senior Director, Internet Policy, International Trademark Association (INTA)</p> 



TUESDAY, 3 May 2016

Session ONE: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda

14:00 – 14:50 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Tomasz Janowski, United Nations University Operating Unit on Policy-Driven Electronic Governance (UNU-EGOV)

High Level Speakers:

1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (BDT)
2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Tomasz Janowski**, United Nations University Operating Unit on Policy-Driven Electronic Governance (UNU-EGOV)
4. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator:** Ms Doreen Bogdan, Chief of Strategic Planning and Membership Department, ITU
5. **Antigua and Barbuda** - H.E. Mr Melford Walter Nicholas, Minister, Ministry of Information, Broadcasting, Telecommunications and Information Technology
6. **Guinea Bissau** - H.E. Mr João Bernardo Vieira, Secretaria de Estado dos Transportes e Comunicações da Guiné-Bissau
7. **Russia** - H.E. Mr Nikolay Nikiforov, Minister, Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation
8. **Group of Fifteen** - Mrs. Samantha Jayasuriya, Deputy Permanent Representative of the Permanent Mission of Sri Lanka to the UN, on behalf of the Group of Fifteen
9. **Commonwealth Telecommunications Organisation**, Mr Shola Taylor - Head of Organization
10. **International Federation for Information Processing (IFIP)** - Mr Leon Strous, President
11. **DiploFoundation and Geneva Internet Platform** - Mr Jovan Kurbalija, Head of Organization
12. **Association of Scientists, Developers and Faculties International** - Mr Kokula Krishna Hari Kunasekaran, Head of Organization



Introduction

The resolution of the United Nations General Assembly on the overall review of the outcomes of WSIS, adopted in December last year, called for close alignment between the WSIS process and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The resolution highlighted the cross cutting contribution that ICT can make to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) noting that access to SDGs is both the means and the ends to development.

To this end, however, the resolution also expressed five major concerns: 1) that existing digital divides prevail and new divides emerge; 2) that the ubiquitous use of ICT must be based on new levels of confidence and security; 3) that the rights of individuals must be protected equally on-line and off-line; 4) that the progress brought in by ICT should be measured not only in economic terms, but also in terms of the realization of human rights and freedoms; and 5) that to serve as a development enabler, ICT must be grounded in ethical foundations. It is against this background that the session was held.

Vision

The session has once again highlighted the potential of ICT to bridge the digital divides, to develop knowledge societies, and to serve as an enabler for sustainable development.

Fresh Priorities

Fresh priorities include promoting innovation and entrepreneurship, e.g. through creating virtual spaces and providing access to advanced technologies, as well as fighting cyber-crime by adopting and implementing cyber security policies.

Emerging trends

Innovation and micro-spaces for inventors and entrepreneurs are appearing across Africa. African innovators are showing increasing leadership, while payment and money remittance services provide enabling conditions for entrepreneurs.

There is a need to move towards collaborative regulation and collaborative policies. We can no longer afford to have vertical policies and regulations.



Opportunities

Access is expanding and ICTs become more available, cheap and integrated into every aspect of our lives, in turn expanding opportunities for innovation and entrepreneurship.

Governments could create incentives, including funding, for ICT innovators to come up with new public service solutions, including birth and car registrations, sanitation, etc.

Setting up affordable social rates for Internet access could create opportunities for creating jobs in small settlements, and accessing affordable e-healthcare, e-education, and e-services.

Key Challenges

We need legislation and rules, as well as incentives and capital, for innovation to grow. The key challenges faced by governments is developing ecosystems and the necessary legal frameworks to offer services that are legally accepted and secure. Another challenge is to strengthen ICT communities in those countries that do not have them, e.g. through professional societies that contribute to developing and sharing knowledge with SMEs.

One of the key challenge of the modern diplomacy is building inclusive solutions. If the worldwide population is to be engaged and follow the global rules on climate change, sustainable development, Internet governance, etc. we need high ownership of what was agreed globally and we need engagement. The key challenge is increasing the inclusiveness of the policy processes, and the involvement of small and developing states.

Modern diplomacy is also challenged by the dichotomy between discretion and transparency. If peaceful resolution of conflicts requires the discretion of negotiation, and reaching compromises, we should allow it. Sometimes transparency could be counterproductive, as in many cultures compromise may be seen as losing face.

Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

Network infrastructure is clearly required for advancing progress on the majority of the SDGs and broadband access can directly impact development. For example, ending poverty will be greatly advanced if the extreme poor have access to basic financial services that help them manage



economic shocks and build wealth, including insurance, loans and microcredits. This can be done if they have and use mobile phones.

The principles of multi-stakeholder engagement that characterized the WSIS process has been validated. The effective participation and cooperation of governments, the private sector, civil society, international organizations, technical and academic communities and other stakeholders, especially with balanced representations from developing countries continue to be vital in developing the information society.

A key condition for achieving the SDGs is the strengthening of local capacities, particularly the capacity of ICT professionals and ICT communities.

Case Examples

Guinea-Bissau is involved in designing a regional West African health information system to take advantage of data generated over cell phones and SMS applications. The aim is to reach out to the poorest in a cost-effective manner to understand their health challenges and turn this information into adaptable health policies.

Guinea-Bissau is also promoting mobile payment services based on which commercial banks offer loans, microcredit, savings, and other financial products and services.

Russia signed a special addition to the federal law on telecommunications concerning the provision of the universal service fund. The goal is to connect in the upcoming four or five years all small villages and settlements with populations of over 250 people with fiber optics. This will involve installing 215,000 kilometers of the fiber optics on land or through submarine cables. 1.2% of the telecom operators' revenues are dedicated to this fund.

ICT graduates are beginning to run successful IT companies in Nigeria. For example, a company called Jumer has a lot of successful in Internet-based e-Commerce. The company was founded by young persons who obtained bank loans to start.

Road ahead



Building partnerships is necessary. Where ICT communities do not exist, industry and governments share the responsibility to build them, helping with establishment, creating international linkages, and strengthening local expertise, knowledge sharing and cooperation. Governments could also put in place policies to ensure that banks set up a portion of their loans or financial supports to SMEs. The SDGs are about leaving no one behind. The further this goal, our role is to ensure that no one is left off-line.

Session TWO: Knowledge Societies, Capacity Building and e-Learning

14:00 – 14:50 / ROOM TWO

1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Shailaja Fennell**, Lecturer in Development Studies, Centre of Development Studies and Department of Land Economy, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom

High Level Speakers

1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU – (DSG)
2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Shailaja Fennell**, Lecturer in Development Studies, Centre of Development Studies and Department of Land Economy, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom
4. **Mr Indrajit Banerjee**, Director, Knowledge Societies Division (KSD), Communication and Information Sector (CI), UNESCO
5. **Burundi** - S.E. Mr Nestor Bankumukunzi, Ministre, Ministère des Postes, des Technologies de l'Information, de la Communication et des Médias
6. **Cuba** - Prof. Mr Ernesto Rodriguez Hernandez, Director General de Informatica, Ministerio de Comunicaciones de Cuba
7. **Djibouti** – H.E. Mr Ali Hassan Bahdon, Minister, Ministry of Communication, responsible for Posts and Telecommunications
8. **Portugal** – H.E. Prof. Manuel Heitor, Minister, Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education



9. **The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia** - H.E. Ms Marta Arsovska Tomovska, Minister, Ministry of Information Society and Administration
10. **Asia-Pacific Telecommunity (APT)** - Ms Areewan Haorangsi, Secretary General
11. **UNITAR** - Mr Alex Mejia, Senior Manager, Representing Head of Organization
12. **National Library of Latvia** - Mr Andris Vilks, Director

Introduction:

- The session on Knowledge Societies, Capacity Building and e-learning has clear linkages to three of the WSIS Action Lines (C3: Access to information and knowledge; C4: Capacity Building; C7: e-learning).
- It directly addresses the objectives of building inclusive societies by overcoming the digital divides between the Global North and Global South, and between rural and urban at the national level.

Fresh Priorities:

- The importance of working with youth, starting from the provision of ICT learning opportunities in primary and secondary schools and going through to provision of digital resources and data banks and tertiary and quaternary education sectors.
- The need to provide financial and technical support to the least developed countries, that suffer from lack of ICT infrastructure, such as submarine communication cables.
- The reduction of the digital divide by focusing directly on the national objectives of people-centred, social justice dimensions that must be realized as nations discuss the digitalization of societies.

Emerging Trends:

- The importance of international cooperation through sharing of knowledge and capacity building programmes and the reduction of cyber crime and espionage.
- Partnerships between the public and private sector are necessary for ensuring the delivery of technological capabilities in ICT by leading companies and organisations.



- The limited financial resources of least developed countries can be bolstered by sharing of good practice in ICT technology design and implementation within geographical regions.

Opportunities:

- The University sector, both academic and vocational training, is an important lever for international collaboration in the provision of new ICT technology training, through providing educational programmes and customized learning.
- National institutions of ICT excellence can become knowledge centres and should take the lead in developing collaborative mechanisms for sharing strategies for developing innovative e-services.
- Public administration can provide Open Data platforms that push for the objectives of accountability and transparency in both public and private sector delivery.

Key Challenges:

- To ensure that ICT provision evolves along with societal needs will require time and finance for the regular upgrading of ICT technologies in countries and the regular training of personnel in the ICT sector.
- To ensure that capacity building activities within a country and a region requires greater attention to coordination across specialist ICT institutions.
- To ensure that the objectives of Open Science and Open Data are achieved as this is crucial for inclusive and equitable access and use of the internet across developed and developing countries.

Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals:

- The provision of ICT based on the objective of inclusive societies directly contributes to the ability of countries to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals.
- The vision of SDGs from the WSIS lens (as set out in the WSIS-SDG matrix) shows the mapping between the two sets of objectives, and we now need a set of purpose-specific indicators that allow us to measure the extent to which increasing ICT coverage and quality advances each SDG goal.



Case Studies

- Micro-learning model, where the learning outcomes of school students can be monitored through open data by the students, school and the public administration.
- The use of innovative teaching methods, such as ‘a laptop for each child’ to increase the availability of ICT technology within the education system.
- The trans-national library service model (Trans-European Network), provide technical and professional expertise that can be accessed by all local citizens, for a range of life choices.

Road Ahead:

- To work on more collaborative practices across nations, for increasing financing of ICT technologies, ensuring public access to digital data, and improving capacity building programmes.
- The setting up of a greater number of platforms: e-Government, e-Learning and other applications, that can provide specific interventions to reduce the digital divide and harness the aspirations of youth.

Session THREE: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda

14:50 – 15:40 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms. Karen McCabe, Senior Director of Technology Policy and International Affairs, IEEE, USA

Introduction

- Mr Houlin Zhao, Secretary-General, ITU (BDT)
- Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America



- High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms. Karen McCabe, Senior Director of Technology Policy and International Affairs, IEEE, USA
- UN Action Line Facilitator: Ms. Marion Barthelemy, Acting Director, Division for Public Administration and Development Management (DPADM), United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA)

High Level Speakers

- H.E. Mr. Daniel A. Sepulveda, Ambassador, Deputy Assistant Secretary Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, US Department of State, United States of America
- H.E. Phommachanh, Minister of Post and Telecommunications, Lao PDR
- Mr. Victor Lagunes, Chief Information Officer, Presidency of Mexico
- Mr. Ömer Fatih Sayan, Head of Information and Communication Technologies Authority, Turkey
- Dr. Vincenzo Spiezia, Senior Economist, Measurement and Analysis of the Digital Economy, Directorate for Science, Technology and Innovation, OECD

Vision

- Digital economy is a powerful catalyst for growth, innovation and social inclusion
- The SDGs enable all sectors of a country's economy to flourish
- ICT are tool to transform countries into modernized economies by reducing poverty and creating jobs
- All people are secure in all their online identities so they can be secure in all their roles and responsibilities

Fresh Priorities

- Open data to create new services
- Stable, transparent regulatory framework, which is friendly to investment in infrastructure and based on competition

Emerging trends

- Growing response from citizens toward bringing forward solutions to government, i.e., crowdsourcing public policy. For example, open data policy in Mexico was crowd-sourced and based on thousands of citizen comments.



Opportunities

- Facilitating development of least developed countries through ICTs such as broadband and public access
- Increasing participation of commercial and noncommercial stakeholders and governments in cooperative and collaborative two-way exchange
- Deployment of 5G
- A stable, predictable and transparent regulatory framework
- UN to be more active on security and trust issues, which can be best addressed by through the UN forum/mechanism
- “Peer review,” formal and informal, to share best practices between states on progress on the digital agenda.

Key Challenges

- Digital divide: how least developed countries can achieve the SDGs by 2030, given the challenges of the digital divide
 - Infrastructure investment
 - Capacity building and skills development for participation in the digital economy
- Complex and interconnected nature of ICT networks necessitates international cooperation to prevent illegal use of ICTs

Case Examples

- Empowering farmers in Lao with ICT to enhance production
- Increasing online access to education in Lao
- Telecommunication reforms in Mexico toward better pricing and increased accessibility to reduce the digital divide
- National dialog in Mexico to improve conversation between government and citizens for co-creation of public policy (e.g., open data policy)
- OECD creating mechanisms for measuring country progress on WSIS Action Lines

Road ahead

- Ministerial meeting in Mexico on progress on WSIS 2030 agenda and WSIS Action Lines. Meeting priorities:



- Internet openness
- Global connectivity, Internet as platform
- Consumer protection, security and trust
- Helping all stakeholders face new challenges to labor markets from the digital economy

Session FOUR: Inclusiveness – Access to Information and Knowledge for All

14:50 – 15:40 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Mr. Klaus Stoll, Executive Director, Global Knowledge Partnership, Germany

High level speakers:

- **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (TSB)
- **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
- 1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Mr. Klaus Stoll**, Executive Director, Global Knowledge Partnership, Germany
- 2. **UN Action Line Facilitator: Mr Indrajit Banerjee**, Director, Knowledge Societies Division (KSD), Communication and Information Sector (CI), UNESCO
- 3. **Algeria** - H.E. Ms Houda Imane Faraoun, Ministère Algérien de la Poste et TIC
- 4. **Bangladesh** – H.E. Mrs Tarana Halim, State Minister, Ministry of Posts, Telecommunications and Information Technology
- 5. **Costa Rica** - H.E. Mrs Elayne Whyte, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Costa Rica to the United Nations Office in Geneva
- 6. **Iran** - H.E. Mr Mahmoud Vaezi, Minister, Ministry of Information & Communication Technology
- 7. **African Civil Society on the Information Society (ACIS)** - Dr. Cisse Kane, President of the African Civil Society on the Information Society (ACSIS)
- 8. **25th Century Technology Limited** - Mr Kwaku Ofofu-Adarkwa, PhD, Chief Executive Officer
- 9. **Rwenzori Center for Research and Advocacy, Uganda** - Mr Jostas Mwebembezi, Head of Organization
- 10. **Health and Environment Program (HEP)** - Ms Madeleine Scherb, Head of Organization



After initial confusion all presenters seemed to appreciate the new interactive approach of the sessions. The session showed a wide array approached but there seemed to some common themes:

Connectivity is only as good as the content that is going with it.
ICT's are relevant and important to all SDGs without exception
Local empowerment, local content, local solutions
Awareness and capacity building at the basic Internet user level is a must.

One important take away from the session was that there is a positive outlook for local and regional development of ICT's and a belief that ICTs are one of the main tools to achieve the SDGs.

The moderator wants to thank their excellencies and the delegations for the understanding and co-operation.

1. Emerging trends

- a. Emphasis on connectivity for all
- b. Emphasis on local content
- c. New partnership models – developing skills as collaborative effort with North and South

2. Opportunities

Governance – engender trust
Secure human rights and social justice
Restructure cyberspace
Rules of Internet should be transparent
No excessive watching over Internet
World Wide Networks that include all



Fiber Optics

Remote countries – Niger, Mali

Reduce Costs

ITU can work as moderator for world problems (carbon emissions)

ITU can link developing countries with proper forum for problems – other member states

Create connected populations at all economic strata

3. Key Challenges

African continent suffering from lack of transparency

Corporate hegemony

Access for all/Universal Access

Low Income

Lack of political will for inclusion – in Africa and globally - lack of linguistic diversity

Lack of digital literacy

Lack of content from Africa

Inclusion is part of Tunis Agenda – Internet is too business oriented

Nuturing local content

Have private sector focus on local investment

4. Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

Links to SDG's

5 – women

9 – infrastructure

10 – inequality

16 – institutions

17 – global partnership

5. Case Examples



Bangladesh Vision 2021

Bangladesh Right to Information Act 2009

Bangladesh Union Digital Centers (4547 in Countries)

Bangladesh National Web Portal

Bangladesh – Post Offices are ePost Centers

Bangladesh – eHealth care. Medicine by mobile phone.

Bangladesh – 1000 women employed by ????

Costa Rica – CR Digital – operationalize goals i.e. universal access.

Costa Rica – Cover gaps in voice and digital services **by subsidizing services** to school, health care, comprehensive care, health care centers, comprehensive care, nutrition centers, telecenters, etc.

Costa Rica – National Telecommunications Development Fund – public/private initiative covering services and devices

Costa Rica - Public Sector – digital literacy/Private Sector – content

Costa Rica - Connected Home Initiative

Iran - More than doubled Internet subscribers. Goal to make broad band available to 80% of households. 18,500 villages provided with broadband with USO funds. Focus on rural areas

Health and Environment Program (HEP)

6. Road ahead

African Civil Society on the Information Society (ACIS) – African Summit to leverage funds from ICT's



Session FIVE: Bridging Digital Divides

15:40 – 16:30 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Chinmayi Arun, Executive Director, Centre for Communication Governance at National Law University Delhi, India

Introduction

- Mr Houlin Zhao, Secretary-General, ITU (BDT)
- Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
- High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms. Chinmayi Arun, Executive Director, Centre for Communication Governance at National Law University Delhi, India
- UN Action Line Facilitator: UN Action Line Facilitator: Mr. Cosmas L. Zavazava Chief of Department, Project Support and Knowledge Management Telecommunication Development Bureau (BDT)

High Level Speakers

- H.E. Mr. Daniel A. Sepulveda, Ambassador, Deputy Assistant Secretary Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, US Department of State, United States of America
- H.E. Dr. Debretsion Gebremichael Measho, Minister, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology, Ethiopia
- H.E. Pastor Ngoua N'Neme, Minister, Ministry of Digital Economy and Posts, Gabon
- H.E. Mr Yasuo Sakamoto, Vice-Minister for Policy Coordination, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, Japan
- Mr Pablo Bello, Secretary General, Asociación Interamericana de Empresas de Telecomunicación (ASIET)
- Mr Alex Wong, Senior Director and Head, Future of the Internet Initiative, World Economic Forum
- Mr Louis Pouzin, Project Director, EUROLINC – France
- Dr. Jimson Olufuye, Chairman, Africa ICT Alliance



Vision

- The Digital Divide remains a critical issue – contributing factors include problems of infrastructure, affordability, skills and awareness and relevant content
- The economic gap between people on both sides of the digital divide is widening, while people with access to the internet prosper economically

Fresh Priorities

- Investment in the physical infrastructure necessary to bridge the digital divide
- Stable and transparent regulatory framework which does not add to the costs of internet infrastructure
- Utilizing recent innovations in ICTs to address the Digital Divide more effectively
- Human resources - working on the knowledge, education and skills of internet users so that they are able to take advantage of the potential of the internet
- Co-ordination globally and regionally to address this issue

Emerging trends

- Private sector experimentation like Google Loon, Facebook's Internet.org and Microsoft's whitespaces project are worth watching
- Recent innovation in technology, such as TV whitespace, solar-powered environments for high speed data sharing can be used to bridge the digital divide

Opportunities

- Experimentation with different ways to bridge the digital divide: public, private and public-private joint ventures
- Global and regional co-ordination to work out how best to leverage resources and to collaborate to address the issue
- Multi-stakeholder approach while creating strategy and policy
- Local language, relevant content that encourages users to come online and make full use of the internet
- Capacity-building to address the social, knowledge component of the digital divide

Key Challenges



- Investing in, and building, infrastructure that can reach physically remote areas and providing access to quality connections and devices to access that connection
- Reducing costs created by local regulation and taxes
- Creating coherent and neutral regulatory frameworks
- Human resource development and capacity-building

Case Examples

- Community centers that provide internet access in Ethiopian villages
- Public-private co-operation to build broadband infrastructure in Gabon
- Japan's collaboration with multiple countries:
 - Cambodia: solar powered environment that enables high speed data sharing in rural areas
 - Nepal: wireless Internet access to schools and medical clinics in mountainous regions
 - Indonesia and Philippines: wireless broadband systems that make use of the unused TV whitespace

Road ahead

- The World Economic Forum has produced an initiative called Internet for All – it has identified four factors around which work can be done to bridge the digital divide: infrastructure, affordability, skills and awareness and relevant content
- G7 has made a joint commitment to refocusing on connectivity
- The WSIS+10 outcome document contains a strong commitment to bridging the Digital Divide

Session SIX: Inclusiveness – Access to Information and Knowledge for All

15:40 – 16:30 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Mr. Pablo Hinojosa, Director, Strategic Engagement, APNIC, Australia

High level speakers:

1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (TSB)



2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Mr. Pablo Hinojosa**, Director, Strategic Engagement, APNIC, Australia
4. **Mr Indrajit Banerjee**, Director, Knowledge Societies Division (KSD), Communication and Information Sector (CI), UNESCO
5. **Nepal** - H.E. Mr Sherdhan Rai, Minister, Ministry of Information and Communication Technology (MoICT)
6. **Senegal** - H.E. Mr Yaya Abdoul Kane, Minister, Minister of Posts and Telecommunications
7. **Serbia** – H.E. Prof. Irimi Reljin, Assistant Minister, Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications
8. **Turkey** – H.E. Mr. Mustafa EROL, Deputy Undersecretary, Ministry of Justice of Turkey
9. **Nigeria** - Prof. Umar Danbatta, Executive Vice Chairman, Nigerian Communications Commission
10. **International Council for Science (ICSU)** - Ms Heide Hackmann, PhD., Executive Director
11. **ChunriChoupaal-The Code To Change** - Ms Iffat Gill, Head of Organization
12. **Swiss Engineering** - Ms Yvette Ramos, MSci.Eng. – MBA, President of Swiss Engineering Genève, President of the Committee, Swiss Engineering Romandie

UN Action Line Facilitator: Mr. Cedric Wachholz, Programme Specialist, WSIS Coordinator, UNESCO

Introduction

This was a panel that was rich in diversity. But all panelists had something in common: ideas with social and economic impact that are in place or forthcoming, to improve inclusive access to information and knowledge.

Vision

The panelists covered a wide range of related issues, for example: digital maturity and the security challenges to overcome; we will talk a lot about openness: open data and big data, even open science. We will talk about inclusion and stakeholder participation. Also we will learn about codes of conduct for engineers to help with digital inclusion.

Fresh Priorities



- Promote digital culture through training to improve basic digital skills.
- Develop e-government applications in the justice, education and health sectors.
- Protection of privacy.
- Accessibility and affordability of ICT services for persons with disabilities.

Emerging trends

- Support the growth of industry and the creation of new jobs through increasing digital technology outputs.
- Regulatory frameworks covering encryption.
- Training of magistrates, judges, police forces to fight against cybercrime.
- Open access to big data
- The concept of open science

Opportunities

- Creation of safe spaces online especially for women and children to overcome inclusion barriers.
- Enable different communication services for those who have visual, cognitive, learning and mobility disabilities.

Key Challenges

- Connectivity to all government schools, hospitals, public service offices, municipalities and public.
- Developing ICT infrastructure in land locked and geographically challenging places.
- Reduce the cost of economic transaction for small and medium enterprises for individuals and to promote innovation.
- Inclusion of underrepresented groups, especially women.

Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)



- Rural connectivity plans supporting education, health, public service, employment generation.

Case Examples

- Rural telecommunication development funds in Nepal
- Universal service provisions in Nigeria, including digital awareness programs, digital appreciation, e-Health and e-accessibility.
- Digital maturity policy actions in Senegal.
- The organization of the international day for young women and the involvement of young women in ICTs in Senegal.
- Accessibility programs for people with disabilities in Serbia
- E-justice services in Turkey.
- The open data and the big data accord by the International Council for Science, the Inter-academy Partnership and the World Academy of Sciences.
- Code of conduct for engineering and ICTs by Swiss Engineering

Road ahead

The WSIS action lines and the WSIS+10 document have given good lines for us to follow the path of technological enhancement and digital inclusion.

Session SEVEN: Enabling Environment

16:30 – 17:00 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF) - Ms. Anriette Esterhuysen, Executive director of the Association for Progressive Communications

, APC, South Africa

High level speakers:



1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU (BR)
2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF) - Ms. Anriette Esterhuysen**, Executive director of the Association for Progressive Communications , APC, South Africa
4. WSIS Action Line Facilitator: **Mr. Kemal Huseinovic**, Chief of the Infrastructure, Enabling Environment and E-Applications Department, ITU
5. **Côte d'Ivoire (Republic of)** - H.E. Mr Bruno Nabagné Koné, Ministre de la Poste et des Technologies de l'Information et de la Communication, Porte-parole du Gouvernement
6. **Maldives** - H.E. Umar Naseer, Minister of Home Affairs
7. **Qatar** – H.E. Mr Khalid Al-Hashimi, Assistant Undersecretary of Minister of Transport
8. **South Africa** - H. E. Prof Hlengiwe Mkhize, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Telecommunications and Postal Services
9. **Zimbabwe** - H. E Dr Win B. J. Mlambo, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Information Communication Technology, Postal and Courier Services
10. **Singapore**, Mr Keng Thai Leong, Deputy Chief Executive, Infocomm Development Authority (IDA)
11. **African Telecommunications Union**, Mr Abdoukarim Soumaila, Secretary General -
12. **Nokia**, Mr Marc Vancoppenolle, Global Head of Nokia Government Relations

All action lines are not equal. Enabling environment is cross cutting. It is focused on the overall context of the vision, policy, regulation, and human and social development that enables addressing access and achieving an inclusive information society. It is the action line that underpins the sustainable implementation of all other action lines.

KEY POINTS

Achieving an enabling environment needs to be approached with a view to integration with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

The starting point is having a clear vision of the power of information and communications as a driver for economic and social development at national level, held by different parts of government and developed with input from other stakeholders.



It requires an integrated approach applied in policy and in regulation. An enabling environment In essence, it requires a broader framework for which involves the free flow of information and human capacity development.

To create a true people centered, inclusive information society, that respects human rights and furthers human rights all stakeholders must work together.

Coordination and collaboration and integration is vital - not only important at the stakeholder level but also between the different government units and departments.

There is a need to prioritize improving citizens' living conditions, bolstering wealth, creating value for countries because ICTs not a goal but a tool for development.

An enabling environment for sustainable ICT use requires investment in broader social, human, and economic development, on a sustainable basis.

There is a need to create attractive and predictable business environments through policies, regulations and legislations, while also taking into consideration existing government policies and institutional environment in developing countries.

Important to focus on human resources to improve digital skills and ensure the entire value chain has the capacity to use ICTs. Focus on key populations who are usually left out of the equation: women, senior citizens, young people.

Use national Internet Governance Forums (IGFs) as a springboard for awareness raising on SDGs. The WSIS documents are a rich resource on information related to SDGs.

While access still unequal most countries do have enough access. There is a need to focus on community access and public access.

There is a need for an integrated approach to creating an enabling environment. An approach that does not only focuses on infrastructure and market regulation but also at other policies, both on the demand side and the supply side.



Put more emphasis on implementation and application. An enabling environment that only focuses on opportunity but that does not actually analyse where there are measures or regulatory contexts are successful or not is not going to be an enabling environment. There is a need to learn from each other – peer to peer to learning from a country level to stakeholder level.

Session EIGHT: ICT Applications and Services

16:30 – 17:00 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Elizabeth Thomas-Raynaud, Senior Policy Executive and Director, International Chamber of Commerce, Digital Economy and BASIS

High level speakers:

1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (DSG)
2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Elizabeth Thomas-Raynaud**, Senior Policy Executive and Director, International Chamber of Commerce, Digital Economy and BASIS
4. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator:** Ms. Marion Barthelemy, Acting Director, Division for Public Administration and Development Management (DPADM), United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA),
5. **Argentina** – H.E. Mrs María Inés Baqué, Secretary of Public Management and Innovation, Ministry of Modernization
6. **Oman - Dr. Salim Al Ruzaiqi**, CEO, Information Technology Authority
7. **Albania** – H.E. Mrs Filloreta Kodra, Ambassador, Permanent Representative of Albania to UNOG
8. **University of Oxford** – Prof Xiaolan Fu, Director of Technology and Management Centre for Development
9. **Thailand – Mrs Arada Fungtong**, Chief of Digital Group, Office of Digital Commerce Department of International Trade Promotion
10. **Accenture** - Mr Justin Keeble, Managing Director
11. **Systemics -PAB LTD** – Ms Malgorzata Olszewska, Director, Regulatory and Government Development



WEDNESDAY, 4 May 2016

Session NINE: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda; Financing for Development and Role of ICT

9:00 – 9:50 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Mr. Nigel Hickson, VP, UN and IGO Engagement; Geneva; ICANN

UN Action Line Facilitator: WSIS Action Line Facilitator: Ms Doreen Bogdan, Chief of Strategic Planning and Membership Department, ITU

Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America

High Level speakers:

1. Georgia –H.E. Mr David Khutsishvili Deputy Minister, Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development
2. Paraguay - S.E. Ing. David Ocampos, Ministro, Secretaría Nacional de Tecnologías de la Información y Comunicación (SENATICs)
3. State of Palestine - H.E. Dr. Allam Mousa, Minister, Ministry of Telecommunications and Information Technology
4. Sudan - H.E. Dr Tahani Abdalla Attia, Minister, Ministry of Communications & Information Technology



5. Uruguay - H.E. Mr Ricardo González Arenas, Ambassador, Permanent Representative of Uruguay to UN in Geneva
6. Just Net Coalition, Mr Norbert Bollow, Co-Convenor
7. EC MEDICI Framework of Cooperation, Prof. Alfredo M. Ronchi, Secretary General

Introduction

This was a geographically diverse panel, which, nevertheless, agreed upon some key messages concerning the development of ICTS in developing countries and the typical drivers that could enhance take-up; and hence influence implementation of some of the key SDGs (for example concerning education). It was also noted how important public service delivery was (a driver in its own right) as well as needs for appropriate governance frameworks.

Vision

There was a collective vision as to how the enhanced use of ICTS within (typically) a developing country could both help reduce the digital divide and help implement the SDGs. Was noted that this was somewhat of a virtuous circle, but one, which was fragile in nature.

Fresh Priorities

While there were no radically new priorities identified there was a real sense on the opportunities developing countries had to rapidly embrace Internet deployment; as long as they did so on an



appropriate and constructive manner. No one should be left behind was a key message that came across.

In terms of implementing the vision above, was also noted the key role developed economies had to help their neighbors.

Emerging trends

There were a number of key trends identified not least the benefits of using public service delivery as a driver for take-up of ICTS in general; the key requirement for educating the young on the Internet (the good and the bad) and also how transparency in policy and legislative changes was key. We also discussed the need for governance frameworks that were democratic and inclusive.

Was clearly articulated that work within countries on developing ICTs would have a positive, and symbiotic relationship with implementing the SDGs nationally.

Opportunities

The opportunities were manifest; not least enhanced economic conditions trade and enhanced social opportunities for citizens; as well as enhanced delivery of public services.

Key Challenges

All the speakers identified that there were challenges in their own environments. These included lack of skills; need to implement complex legislation; inconsistent policy frameworks; monopolies and bad actors (especially on cyber-security).



Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

There were clear links to the WSIS Actions Lines but also to specific SDGs such as those concerning education; access; healthcare and poverty reductions.

Case Examples

- The rapid and successful deployment of fast broadband and mobile connectivity in Georgia;
- The rapid take up of public services through mobile platforms in Paraguay;
- The development of public services and promotion of development of relevant local content in the State of Palestine; giving a key reason for access take-up;
- The creative work done in the Sudan to enhance the citizen experience;
- The significant poverty reduction in Uruguay through ICT adoption;
- The need for attention to be paid to commercial monopolies and their potential effect on local providers;
- The need for ICT sector to be inclusive and transparent

Road ahead

The WSIS Forum and related initiatives (for example that by UNCTAD) are key to providing countries with practical help and assistance.

Session TEN: Digital Economy and Trade

9:00 – 9:50 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms. Marilyn Cade - Board Member of WAVE and Advisor to ICT Associations from Developing Countries

Introduction



High Level Policy Session TEN: Digital Economy and Trade

- MR. Malcomn Johnson, Deputy Secretary General, ITU
- Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
- High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Marilyn Cade, Board Member
- UN Action Line Facilitator: UN Action Line Facilitator: Torbjorn Fredriksson, Chief of ICT Analysis Section, UNCTAD

High Level Speakers

- **Mr. Malcolm Johnson, Deputy Secretary General, ITU**
 - **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Marilyn Cade** - Board Member of WAVE and Advisor to ICT Associations from Developing Countries
 2. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator: Mr Torbjörn Fredriksson**, Chief of ICT Analysis Section, UNCTAD
 3. **Indonesia** - H.E. Ms Mariam Fatima Barata, Vice Minister for Information Application, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology
 4. **Iran** - H.E. Mr Nasrollah Jahangard, Vice-Minister, ICT Deputy Minister and Chairman of Information Technology Organization of Iran
 5. **Sri Lanka** - Mrs. Samantha Jayasuriya, Deputy Permanent Representative of the Permanent Mission of Sri Lanka to the UN
 6. **United Kingdom** - H.E. Mr. Julian Braithwaite, UK Ambassador and Permanent Representative to the United Nations in Geneva

Vision

- Digital transformation is affecting all aspects of human life, and this will only increase in the future – resulting in a digitization of the economy and of social and civic life, even in the smallest of countries
- Digital economy and trade, taken together provide key building blocks for all developing countries, regardless of their geography – and affect everyone, not just the business sector.
- Achieving the SDGs and the 2030 Agenda is a common goal and is essential to fulfil the vision of the people entered, information society for all of the world's citizens



- ICTs can be used to enable better lives – addressing some of the challenges that are faced today, and to create new economic and social opportunities
- The Digital economy can enable even a micro business or organization to thrive
- A reliable and trusted environment online is an essential element

Fresh Priorities

- Adopting and adapting to the Digital Economy will be required for all citizens in their personal, civic, and economic lives
- Developing fast track approaches to build digital skills for youth, women, and persons with disabilities, or in poverty
- Ensuring that the National Strategies incorporate and embracing by the full range of governmental agencies [across all Ministries] of the Digital Economy and all that implies
- Adapting organizations to understand

Emerging Trends

- Increased engagement of citizens in affecting the design of services, both from government and also from business
- Stronger cooperation across international organizations and stakeholders to address these challenges

Opportunities

- Creation of new kinds of work and opportunities that provide new kinds of work for the world's unemployed youth population
- Strengthening the inclusion of women, SMEs and NGOs in the digital economy/world will bring
- Creating the 'right regulatory' framework is essential to maintain the open nature of the Internet and WWW, but also to provide the safeguards against cyber crime or cyber bullying, etc. – must be done carefully and keeping in mind the importance of the open nature of the Internet

Key Challenges

- In a pervasive digitized world, new “divides” may develop
- Infrastructure, capacity building and digital skills development to the most disadvantaged
- Capacity building and skills development for participation in the digital economy



- Cyber safety online, and resiliency
- Tension between pace of human development/adaptation to change, and the rapid rate of technological advancement

Case Examples

- E-Sri Lanka Development Initiative creating ‘most connected government in region
- Country wide Unique Digital Identity and Household Fund Transfer Management System – Sri Lanka
- Growth in exports revenue
- National e-commerce Roadmap – developed in multi stakeholder manner - Indonesia
- Indonesia – established target of 1000 technopreneurs
- UK – strong linkages between development of digital economy strategy and engagement and consultation with stakeholders through process
- UK- engagement with international agencies and organizations

Road ahead

- Opportunity to also discuss these challenges at the Internet Government Forum in Mexico Dec 2016 and at the national IGFs
- Broadening the awareness of the fundamental and essential role that the digital economy plays in the achievement of all the SDGs
- Adaptation to digital economy by labor forces and companies, government agencies and skills development for women and youth, persons in very remote geographical areas

Session ELEVEN: Bridging Digital Divides

9:50 – 10:40 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Greg Shannon, Ph.D., Chief Scientist for the CERT Division, Software Engineering Institute at Carnegie Mellon University, Past Chair of the IEEE Cybersecurity Initiative, USA

High level speakers:



- **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
- 1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF):** Dr. Greg Shannon, Ph.D., Chief Scientist for the CERT Division, Software Engineering Institute at Carnegie Mellon University, Past Chair of the IEEE Cybersecurity Initiative, USA
- 2. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator:** Mr Cosmas L. Zavazava Chief of Department, Project Support and Knowledge Management Telecommunication Development Bureau (BDT)
- 3. **Cyprus (Republic of)-** H.E. Mr Marios Demetriades, Minister of Transport, Communications and Works
- 4. **Mauritius** - H.E. Mr Etienne Sinatambou, Minister of Technology, Communication and Innovation
- 5. **Vietnam** - H.E. Mr PHAM Hong Hai, Deputy Minister of Ministry of Information and Communication
- 6. **Zambia** – on behalf of H.E. Mr Kapembwa Simbao, Minister, Ministry of Transport, Works, Supply and Communications, Mrs Margaret Kaemba
- 7. **UNESCWA** – Mr Haidar Fraihat, Ph.D., Director, Technology for Development Division (TDD)
- 8. **VimpelCom** - Mr Tomas Lamanauskas, Group Director Public Policy
- 9. **Microsoft, Affordable Access & Smart Financing, Microsoft 4Afrika Initiative** - Mr Frank McCosker, General Manager
- 10. **eWorldwide Group** – Dr Salma Abbasi, Chairman and CEO

A document produced last year was the “WSIS-SDG Matrix Linking WSIS Action Lines with Sustainable Development Goals.” In that document, the word “access” occurs 257 times. Relevant content and effective use are essential for meaningful access. The digital divide concerns differences in access, content, and use. These differences are often unfortunate, unnecessary, and detrimental to society. Eliminating such digital gaps are essential to achieving the 2030 sustainable development goals as well as advancing all of the WSIS Action Lines. Though digital divides are varied and often wide, this session showed that digital divides in access, content, and use are narrowing due to innovations in technology, partnerships, public policies, and governance.

Vision



- Universal access for all, including remote communities and individuals with limited financial means
- Digital content and benefits for all
- Innovation in technology, partnerships, policy, and governance to enable society to bridge digital divides

Fresh Priorities

- Broadly developing the skills of user
- Educating mid- and upper-level government officials on ICT policy and governance
- Enable and amply private investment since the private sector is often 80% or more of the solution

Emerging trends

- Leverage existing infrastructure such as post offices and television broadcast spectrum
- National ICT ecosystems must be competitive yet stable enough for operators to earn reasonable profits
- Context-relevant public-private partnerships can be fast and efficient mechanisms to bridge digital divides
- Society is broadly recognizing the important role of ICTs for general sustainable economic development

Opportunities

- Use of universal funds bridge digital divides for communities and individual with limited financial means
- Memorandums of understanding between national regulatory agencies
- Optimizing the use of under utilized broadcast spectrum

Key Challenges

- Providing users with the skills they need to take advantage of access and content
- Cybersecurity since threats increase as ICT infrastructure and capabilities become ever more valuable to society



- Consumer protection in the digital eco-systems for newly connected communities and individuals

Case Examples

- 96% broadband access in Cyrus
- Use of post offices for community WiFi hot spots in Mauritius
- Use of universal service funds in Viet Nam and Zambia to provide access to remote communities and financially challenged users
- Use of underutilized TV broadband spectrum by Microsoft in Africa
- Training mid-level civil servants on ICT policy and governance in west asia
- Use of application-development competitions to empower communities as active ICT consumers (not passive) by VimpelCom

Road ahead

- Relevant content and effective use(rs) are the key challenges emerging as access issues are addressed
- Innovation is the solution to bridging digital divides AND the benefit of bridging those divides

Session TWELVE: Enabling Environment; Cybersecurity; Climate Change

9:50 – 10:40 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms. Anna Slomovic, Lead Research Scientist, Cyber Security and Privacy Research Institute, George Washington University, USA

High level speakers:

1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU (DSG)
2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms. Anna Slomovic**, Lead Research Scientist, Cyber Security and Privacy Research Institute, George Washington University, USA
4. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator: Mr. Preetam Maloor**, i.a. Head of Corporate Strategy Division, ITU



5. **Democratic Republic of the Congo** – H.E. Mr Thomas LUHAKA LOSENDJOLA, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of ICT, Ministry of Posts, Telecommunications & ICT, DRC
6. **Malaysia** - H.E. Mr Jailani Bin Johari, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Communications and Multimedia, Malaysia **(TBC)**
7. **Chad** - H.E. Mr BAMANGA Abbas Malloum, Ambassador of Chad to the Swiss Confederation, Representative of The Minister of Posts and ICT
8. **Moldova** - Mr Grigore Varanita, Director, National Regulatory Agency for Electronic - Communications and Information Technology
9. **Council of Europe** - H.E. Mr Dirk Van Eeckhout, Thematic Coordinator for the Information Policy (TC-INF), Council of Europe and Ambassador of Belgium to the Council of Europe
10. **International Professional Practice Partnership (IFIP IP3)** - Ms Brenda Aynsley, Chairman
11. **Green Data Center LLP** - Mr Matthew Rajendra, Founder & Chief Executive Officer

12. **Potomac Institute for Policy Studies**, Ms Melissa Hathaway, Head of Organization

Introduction

A diverse panel addressed the topics of Session 12. The panel included representatives from four continents. Participants represented governments, intergovernmental organizations, NGOs and the private sector.

Vision

- Climate change should not be sole responsibility of governments
- Optimum use of ICTs can support the fight against poverty
- ICTs can be used to bridge the economic divide between Africa and the rest of the world
- ICTs underpin almost all significant innovations in the foreseeable future
- ICTs produce not only economic benefits, but also an effect on humans. Holistic, multistakeholder approach can ensure that resources are sustainable and available for generations to come.

Fresh Priorities

- Providing incentives for ICT operators to move outside urban areas



- Improving and maintaining trust in the use of ICTs
 - Creating appropriate regulatory frameworks for protection of user data
 - Training of ICT professionals to build in “human rights by design”
- Improving environmental footprint of data centers and other ICT through reduction in energy use and reducing eWaste by recycling old or unused devices

Emerging trends

- Countries are adjusting their legal and regulatory frameworks to enable the use of ICTs for development
 - New legislation in the Democratic Republic of Congo, developed in consultation with the commercial sector and civil society, will remove impediments to ecommerce and other development, deployment and uses of ICTs
 - Moldova’s telecoms regulator has created a national plan on the EU model, Cybersecurity 2020, to increase trust in the use of ICTs
 - Council of Europe, which includes not just the EU but many other countries, offers the Budapest Convention on Cybersecurity to countries around the world in order to promote a common set of rules for global data flows
- Increasing awareness of environmental footprint of ICTs, both in use of energy for data centers and in eWaste, and efforts to increase the use of “green” ICT technologies
- Particularly in areas of robotics and artificial intelligence (AI), increasing awareness of the need for training ICT professionals on ethical issues and ways in which their work affects human users.

Opportunities

- New legislative and regulatory frameworks to remove barriers to ICT development and deployment
- Working with all stakeholders--governments, civil society, private sector and academia--to create legislative and regulatory approaches to complex and multifaceted issues in privacy, cybersecurity and data protection
- Partnerships and economic development funding to deploy fiber on a large scale



- Data center industry can improve its environmental resilience and energy efficiency by taking advantage of new “green” technology. Even old data centers can be retrofitted for better air flow, greatly increasing efficiency.
- Mentorship programs and toolkits for training the ICT workforce to account for different approaches in different countries

Key Challenges

- African countries with large territories require significant investments in order to deploy sufficient fiber to cover the land area
- Need to create proper incentives for telecoms operators to deploy and operate infrastructure, particularly outside cities
- Need to encourage positive uses of the Internet while restraining harmful and illegal uses
- Need to increase capacity and diversity in the ICT workforce while increasing professionalism of the workforce
- Lack of trust in ICTs slows down development and reduces profitability and economic benefits. Issues like encryption are complex and lack simple framing and simple solutions
- Greenhouse gases from fossil fuel use to power data centers have an effect on addressing climate change

Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

The session addressed

- Action Line C5, Building Confidence and Security in Use of ICTs
- Action Line C6, Enabling Environment
- SDG 13, Climate Change

Case Examples

- Green ICT Initiative in Malaysia
- World Bank funding of updated telecoms legislation in the Democratic Republic of Congo
- Moldova’s adoption of the EU regulatory model to increase security of networks and users



- Data center industry improvements through retrofitting existing data centers for lower environmental impact
- Collaborative activities under the Budapest Convention on Cybersecurity to train judges, set up special forensic units, etc.

Road ahead

- Governments working in partnership with industry and other stakeholders to maximize positive uses of ICTs
- Working in a holistic, multistakeholder manner to ensure sustainability of resources and improve quality of life
- Using regulatory frameworks to support deployment and uses of ICTs

Session THIRTEEN: Bridging Digital Divides

10:40 – 11:30 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Cisse Kane, President, African Civil Society on the Information Society (ACSIS), Senegal

1. **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU (BR)
2. **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
3. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Dr. Cisse Kane**, President, African Civil Society on the Information Society (ACSIS), Senegal
4. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator:** Mr. Kemal Huseinovic, Chief of the Infrastructure, Enabling Environment and E-Applications Department, ITU
5. **Guinea (Republic of)** - S.E. M Moustapha Mamy Diaby, Ministre, Ministère des Postes, Télécommunications et de l'Économie Numérique
7. **India**, National Internet Exchange of India, CEO & Joint Secretary, Department of Electronics & Information Technology, Mr Rajiv Bansal



8. Internet Society (ISOC) - Mr Raúl Echeberría, Vice President

Vision

Look at all means and all groups of people (including those who have not the opportunity to go to school) and identify specific solutions for them in order to get them on board

Complement digital inclusion with investment in local languages and cultures

Include people who have not been to school

Make people concerned about ICT

ICT as an enabler for development and wealth (education, training, and sensitization), not only for fun

Fresh Priorities

Not only follow business models and aspirations

Not only see people as a market but stick to their own needs and aspirations

Avoid gadgetisation

Promote appropriation of ICT through topic interesting populations

Emerging Trends

Software, interfaces and applications in local languages (India)

Networking on critical Internet issues (ISOC)

Culture and local contents

Opportunities

Africa with big potential of growth

The youth

Local languages and cultures as a new market for ICT and an opportunity to narrow digital gaps

Rural areas

Improving quality of service

Demography can lower costs like in India



Session FOURTEEN: WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda; Financing for Development and Role of ICT

10:40 – 11:30 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Iffat Gill, Head of Organization The Code To Change, ChunriChoupaal

High level speakers:

- **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (TSB)
- **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
- 1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Iffat Gill**, Head of Organization The Code To Change, ChunriChoupaal
- 2. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator: Ms Doreen Bogdan**, Chief of Strategic Planning and Membership Department, ITU
- 3. **Azerbaijan** - H.E. Mr Elmir Velizadeh, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Communications and High Technologies of the Republic of Azerbaijan
- 4. **Namibia** - H.E. Mr Tweya Tjekero, Minister of Information and Communication Technology
- 5. **Brazil** – H.E. Mr Maximiliano Salvadori Martinhão, Secretary of Telecommunications, Ministry of Communications of the Federative Republic of Brazil
- 6. **Argentina** – Mrs Clarisa Lifsic, Secretary of Investment Promotion, Ministry of communications, Argentina
- 7. **Portugal** – Mr Manuel Costa Cabral, CEPT/ Co-President
- 8. **Tunisia** – Dr Hafedh Ghaddab, chargé de la coopération internationale et des relations externes, Ministère des Technologies de la communication et de l'économie numérique
- 9. **Union Nationale des Travailleurs Démocrates** - Mr Mouhamadou Bamba KA, Head of Organization

Introduction and summary:

Session fourteen had the pleasure to get started ahead of time and was considered to be one of the 'most interactive sessions.' The speakers were contacted ahead of time for the session and the questions personally and this contributed greatly to the openness of the panelists to take questions, some of which



were new, and not pre-submitted. Most of our panelists were mindful of the time slots and this allowed us to further the debate and get new perspectives from the High Level panelists.

The input from the WSIS Action Line facilitator and the WSIS Forum 2016 chairman were most helpful in moving the discussion forward. Panelists from the government were more open to share ideas and perspectives when some of their past accomplishments were highlighted. Overall, it was a truly engaging and fruitful discussion on Financing for Development and the Role of ICTs.

Vision

- Knowledge is powerful catalyst for uptake of ICTs and it is the key to uplift underserved communities from poverty.
- Low up-take of broadband is a big challenge for leveraging
- Training of skilled labour for achieving the SDGs
- Developed countries need to support developing countries to reach their goals of implementing an financing ICTs for development.
- Inclusion of underrepresented groups especially women is at the heart of implementing financing ICTs for development

Fresh Priorities

- Making knowledge and its availability at the heard of financing ICTs for development for improving lives.
- Low up-take of broadband (Access) and its implications on the implementation strategies
- Digital schools for inclusion of next generation of leaders
- Importance of supporting SMEs an start-ups by governments
- Role of international best practices to accelerate
- High costs of connectivity that contribute to low uptake of broadband

Emerging trends

- The role of ICTs as a tool for nurturing development to meet the goals of WSIS Action Lines and the 2030 Agenda.



- The role of platforms like WSIS Forum and Internet Governance Forum in the implementation of inclusive strategies for ICT for development.

Opportunities

- Sharing knowledge and learning from best practices in both developed and developing countries
- Supporting developed countries to ensure ICT for All.
- Following progress of countries that are involved in WSIS forums and Internet Governance Forum and looking at the progress and impact of such processes.
- Facilitating development of least developed countries through ICTs such as broadband and public access

Key Challenges

- Broadband uptake due to high costs
- Digital divide and certain divides within divides like gender divide
- Access to knowledge for access ICTs for development
- Training needs for skilled labour and aligning them to the needs of local communities.

Case Examples

- Tunisia 2.0 and digital schools for children in Tunisia
- Financing of SMEs and star-ups in Azerbaijan
- Positive impact of hosting IGF Baku, by Azerbaijan and its impact on shaping and implementing policies for ICT for development
- National strategic plan of Tunisia to implement ICTs for development
- New ministry of communication in Argentina to implement strategies to use ICTs as a tool for development.

Road ahead

- Ministerial meeting in Mexico on progress on WSIS 2030 agenda and WSIS Action Lines. Meeting priorities:
 - ICT 4 ALL
 - Inclusion of all groups and underrepresented communities.
 - Regional and global cooperation to enable access for all.
 - ICTs as a tool for implementing development



- Helping train skilled labour to make use of the ICTs to improve lives and alleviate poverty

Session FIFTEEN: Enabling Environment

11:30 – 12:15 / ROOM ONE

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF) : Mr Frank McCosker, General Manager, Affordable Access & Smart Financing, Microsoft

High level speakers:

- **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (BDT)
- **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
 1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF) :** Mr Frank McCosker, General Manager, Affordable Access & Smart Financing, Microsoft
 2. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator:** Mr Cosmas L. Zavazava Chief of Department, Project Support and Knowledge Management Telecommunication Development Bureau (BDT)
 3. **Mali - H.E. Dr Choguel Kokalla Maïga, Ministre**, Ministère de l'Economie numérique, de l'Information et de la Communication
 4. **Mexico** – Mrs Adriana Sofía Labardini Inzunza, Commissioner, Federal Telecommunications Institute
 5. **Egypt** – Dr. Abeer Shakweer PhD, Minister's Advisor for social responsibility, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology
 6. **Center for Democracy & Technology** - Mr Matthew Shears, Director, Global Internet Policy and Human Rights
 7. **Somali Youth Development Foundation (SYDF)** - Mr Abdullahi Mohamed, Head of Organization (TBC)
 8. **Association for Progressive Communications (APC)** - Mrs Anriette Esterhuysen, Executive Director
 9. **African Network Information Center and Carnegie Mellon University** - Ms Aminata Garba, Director of AFRINIC & Assistant Professor at CMU



MALI-

Establishing a legal environment – personal data protection and establishment of the DP Agency and law on Cryptology in 2015

Enabling laws for electronic transactions

Mexico-

Created in 2013. 2 years removing barriers, mandating access to networks to incumbent.

Prices have decreased by 30% in last 5 years, in mobile 18% in last 2.5 years.

More Spectrum for broadcasting and policy for more efficient use of spectrum. Non-profit licenses for indigenous communities.

Award winner for tool to compare rates. Access policies for operators –

More choices enabling more people.

Egypt

2 revolutions since 2011

ICT initiatives 1 Infrastructure National BB plan incl underserved areas to 90% by 2021 – key issue network availability

Technology parks across the country 7 – 2 already implemented away from the capital

Presidential initiative for cloud computing, data analytics

New laws working on – access to information awaiting parliament

ICT for Social strategy – empowerment for disabilities

Center for Democracy

up a level big picture

WB report – on analog complements

Important regarding: we are not realising full digital dividend because of enabling environments



Concentrations of power will occur if enabling environments do exist

Human – 2013 the business case for women empowerment – access to equitable and safe employment, access to training, freedom from violence, social protection and child care

APC

Governments need to trust citizens and civil society

Freedom of expression- protection

AFRIC

IoT – WW hot topic – Energy infrastructure- to enable ICT

Rural Areas – design of policies

Specific challenges – spectrum, sim cards, data

Session SIXTEEN: Media; Cultural Diversity and Heritage, Linguistic Diversity and Local Content; Ethical Dimensions of Information and Knowledge Societies

11:30 – 12:15 / ROOM TWO

High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Lori S. Schulman, Senior Director, Internet Policy, International Trademark Association (INTA)

High level speakers:

- **Mr Houlin Zhao**, Secretary-General, ITU- (TSB)
- **Chairman: Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda**, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Economic and Business Affairs, United States of America
- 1. **High-Level Track Facilitator (HLTF): Ms Lori S. Schulman**, Senior Director, Internet Policy, International Trademark Association (INTA)
- 2. **WSIS Action Line Facilitator: Mr Indrajit Banerjee**, Director, Knowledge Societies Division (KSD), Communication and Information Sector (CI), UNESCO
- 3. **Bangladesh NGOs Network for Radio and Communication** - Mr Bazlur Ahm Rahman, CEO of Organisation



4. **Bridge Africa** - Ms Maxine Moffett, CEO
5. **Association for Proper Internet Governance** - Mr. Richard Hill, President, APIG
6. **World VR Forum** – Mr Salar Shahna, Creative Director and Co-Founder
7. **Cybervolunteers Foundation** - Ana Viñals Blanco, Cybervolunteer of the organization

Introduction

The panel was comprised of representatives of five NGO's who are implementing successful programs and policies that advance multiple SDG's. Three of our panelists represent organizations who have won 2016 WSIS Prizes. The NGO's highlighted their initiatives which are empowering communities through creating local content and entrepreneurial websites, promoting Internet literacy, expanding the boundaries of educational technology through virtual reality applications and providing opportunities for youth and women in developing economies. There were 3 women on the panel including the moderator. Vice Secretary Johnson sat in the meeting in place of Secretary Zhao.

Emerging trends

- Local content is key to accessibility/connectivity. It is not a sidebar issue.
- Grassroots activism
- Sophisticated users sharing knowledge with new users of ICTs
- Connectivity is equated with productivity
- Using technology that is typically associated with entertainment for educational, health and creative art applications
- Connectivity is about radios and phones

Opportunities

- To share what has already been learned through programs like the WSIS Forum
- To leverage existing programs to create new programs
- To reach out to small and emerging businesses and encourage them to participate as representatives of the private sector at WSIS and other forum



Key Challenges

- Access for users with disabilities
- There is more local content in Tokyo than the entire content of Africa
- Reaching the diverse population we wish to see represented (i.e., SME's and local content creators.
- Keeping up with the pace of technological growth
- Opening up the multistakeholder model given the challenges with language, funding, distance, use of industry specific technical jargon
- Digital Amnesia – what do we do with all of the knowledge? We have to think about preserving and transmitting knowledge to future generation

Link with the WSIS Action Lines and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

- 01 – ending poverty
- 03 – health
- 04 – education
- 05 – women
- 08 – economic growth
- 09 – infrastructure/innovation
- 10 – inequality (of nations)
- 11 – habitation
- 16 - institutions (effective, accountable at all levels)

Case Examples

- Cyber Volunteers Foundation Empoderalive – (next meeting September 20 and 21 where volunteers share their knowledge with less experienced users)
- Bangladesh NGO's Network for Radio and Communication - Empowering Youth Women Through Community Media in Bangladesh (women and youth producing local content using radio and telephone technology)



- Bridge Africa – Connectivity is Productivity (creating websites and means of trade using laptops and phones)
- VR Forum – immersive education project (immersivevreducation.com uses virtual reality technology to place students of all ages in the middle of the education environment can visit places in the past, present and future; using virtual reality models for science and art education)
- APIG – creation of an Internet social forum at <http://internetsocialforum.net/isf>
- UNESCO – Memory of the World project focuses on documentary heritage;

Road ahead

The road ahead is exciting as there is a growing awareness of the power of ICTs to bring divides in language, culture and gender equality. While ICT's are clear economic drivers the social aspects are equally important as we advance ICT usage through the creation of local content, making ICTs relatable to all users whether male or female, young or old, urban or rural or whatever language they speak. The next steps include working more in the local context, fostering digital literacy and creating a global, internet citizenry. The programs of the types described by the panel should be supported and expanded wherever possible. There was a suggestion to include community broadcasters and academics at next year's WSIS.