



The 11th Internet Governance Forum (IGF)

Chair's Summary

[9 December 2016]¹

• 6-9 December 2016, Jalisco, México •

Executive Summary:

The 11th IGF was held from 6 to 9 of December 2016 in Zapopan, Jalisco, México. The meeting marked the first gathering of the global multistakeholder IGF community since the renewal of the IGF's mandate for 10 years by the United Nations General Assembly at the WSIS+10 High Level Event last year. With the overall meeting theme of 'Enabling Inclusive and Sustainable Growth', the IGF provided a substantive platform for engaged and informed discussions about, among many other things, how the Internet can support and help to enable sustainable growth as envisaged by the [2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development](#).

In the course of four days, more than 2000 delegates from 83 countries participated in approximately 200 sessions at the IGF, with thousands more stakeholders actively engaging online. The overall programme was developed in a bottom-up and inclusive manner in consultation with the growing IGF community; with a view to enhance wide-ranging and diverse multistakeholder participation. The busy and productive meeting featured interactive dialogue and debate, and addressed a broad range of themes and issues including, but not limited to, the Internet and sustainable development; access and diversity; youth and gender challenges pertaining to the Internet; the protection and promotion of human rights online; cybersecurity; the need to enhance multistakeholder cooperation; critical Internet resources; Internet governance capacity-building; and other emerging issues that may affect the future of the open Internet.

The IGF is unique in the sense that it is [convened by the United Nations Secretary General](#) to be an open, multistakeholder forum bringing all stakeholders together as equals. Its UN mandate gives it convening power and the authority to serve as a neutral space for all stakeholders. As the community embarked on the second decade of the IGF, exchanges throughout the week recognized the important contribution the Internet makes in promoting social inclusion and economic growth. The importance of the Internet and its governance as a powerful tool to promote social inclusion and economic growth using transparent and inclusive multistakeholder approaches is clear.

To promote extensive stakeholder inclusion, [transcripts](#) and [webcasts](#) from all of the sessions were made instantly available throughout the meeting. In the coming days, workshop reports and summaries of all the sessions will also be published on the IGF's website. To complement these

¹ Draft as of 9 December. Final summary will be published on the IGF's website in the coming days.

outputs, the Geneva Internet Platform, in cooperation with the IGF Secretariat, the Internet Society (ISOC), and the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN), delivered detailed and immensely useful [reporting](#) from all sessions. These summaries were published online as well as in daily printed newspapers distributed at the venue for delegates onsite. Providing even further opportunity to participate and enhance institutional memory of the dialogue that took place, all sessions were also [live streamed, and session videos](#) were instantly uploaded for online viewing. IGF social media channels such as [Twitter #IGF2016](#) and [Facebook](#) were also particularly active during the busy week, and facilitated additional platforms for dialogue. [Daily video highlight films](#) and [UN press releases](#) were furthermore produced and made instantly available to the global media to extend the IGF's outreach.

Highlights:

- Many sessions throughout the week provided the community with vibrant spaces to explore the important question of how to harness renewed global interest in **increasing meaningful, empowering access to the Internet** in a way that supports development efforts in line with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Participants reiterated that digital literacy and the development of local and culturally diverse and relevant content is fundamental for inclusive growth. An emerging consensus has developed amongst the IGF community that the Internet's core values of openness, freedom, resilience, safety, and decentralisation are fundamental for **enabling inclusive and sustainable growth** - as is also expressed by UNESCO's Internet Universality framework.
- Many delegates emphasized that **international cooperation and strategic partnerships** cultivated through the IGF can help bridge digital divides and provide crucial new opportunities for people living in poverty, women and girls, children, persons with disabilities, older persons, indigenous peoples, marginalised groups, as well as rural communities that still lack acceptable and quality access and training in the use of ICTs and the Internet.
- The IGF has remained a critical platform to facilitate dialogue on **human rights and their connections with Internet policy and governance**; while discussions about the importance of human rights on the Internet have similarly become increasingly prominent at the IGF. This year, increased attention has also been paid to the importance of civil and political rights - including the ways in which the promotion and protection of these rights can support sustainable development.
- The successful **transition of the IANA functions** to the multistakeholder community in October of 2016, only a few months prior to the 11th IGF, marks an important milestone for the multistakeholder Internet governance community. The transition was finalised after many months of careful planning and deliberation by community volunteers; leading to productive exchanges about the post-transition IANA and the new community-based accountability mechanisms to ensure transparent and stable management of this crucial Internet function. At the IGF, various workshops and sessions endeavoured to learn from the successes and challenges of this important multistakeholder exercise.
- A number of sessions addressed the growing challenges stemming from increased use of the Internet around the world, along with the ways in which such use may threaten the security and development benefits of the Internet. Stakeholders stressed the need for **cybersecurity** measures to be implemented in cooperation with all stakeholders and international expert bodies; with the IGF providing a unique space for such collaborative efforts. Security

professionals, law enforcement agencies, programmers, and business people, among others, have to work together in order to address new threats and challenges to online security for both individuals and organizations. Cyberattacks, cybercrime and issues related to privacy and surveillance are challenges that require urgent collaboration and cooperation as well.

- In the Internet's tradition of allowing for unlimited creation of new opportunities, the **Internet of Things and artificial intelligence** have the potential to bring about ground-breaking benefits to mankind and our quality of life. The challenge is to foster this continuous development and to enable the IoT to further grow into the Internet and Internet governance processes. Issues and challenges such as standardisation, interoperability, and security are very similar to issues the Internet dealt with in its young history, and offer substantial opportunities for multistakeholder cooperation and mutual learning.
- **National, Regional and Youth IGFs (NRIs)** have been emerging spontaneously ever since the IGF was convened in 2006. They are independent in their work, and organized in accordance with the core IGF principles of being multistakeholder, bottom-up, inclusive, open, transparent and non-commercial. The NRI network nearly doubled since the 10th IGF; growing from 37 NRIs at the end of 2015 to a current record of 72 recognised NRIs. The NRIs are active and immensely useful contributors to the IGF community's intersessional activities. The linkages between the NRIs and the global IGF have increased significantly thanks to many joint work activities such as the organization of sessions held during the 11th IGF, collaborative work on developing publications containing guidelines, and best practices on how to establish and run a successful NRI. Records from the NRIs' regular fortnightly meetings also serve as valuable and tangible inputs to the global IGF; providing more local and issue-specific perspectives to policy challenges.
- In 2016, the IGF furthered its work on [Policy Options for Connecting and Enabling the Next Billion\(s\)](#). This year, the intersessional initiative focused on local and regional specificities to enabling meaningful access and also investigated how ensuring meaningful Internet access can support the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). **CENB Phase II** of this seminal work builds on the IGF community's work on this topic in 2015 (Phase I). Together, over 120 substantive contributions from a diversity of stakeholders and stakeholder groups are reflected in this initiative, which helps to illustrate the need for not only enabling more people to access the Internet, but also for them to benefit from and be empowered by the developmental potential of the Internet.
- [The IGF Best Practice Forums \(BPFs\)](#) continue to offer unique platforms to investigate topical Internet policy challenges by collecting community input and experiences in a flexible and bottom-up manner. The **BPFs** gather knowledge that exists with different groups, organizations, experts and individuals, to make it available as a useful resource to the broader community in the form of tangible best practice outcome documents. Through their substantive outreach efforts and continued calls for input and contributions, the BPFs enabled more diverse and varied participation in IGF processes, including from a richer variety of regions and stakeholder groups. By continuously involving new people in their work, the various BPFs also contributed to enlarging the global footprint of the IGF. As a part of the 2016 community intersessional activities, the third cycle of BPFs focused on [Gender and Access, Understanding the Commercial and Economic Incentives behind a Successful IPv6 Deployment, Contributing to the success and continued development of Internet exchange points \(IXPs\), and Building Confidence and Security in the use of Information and Communications Technologies \(ICTs\) through Enhanced Cooperation and Collaboration](#). BPFs worked throughout the year in an open and inclusive way via open mailing lists, regular virtual meetings and BPF workshops during the 11th IGF meeting.

- Using their first-ever shared main session at IGF 2015 as a starting point, **IGF Dynamic Coalitions** held [regularly monthly meetings](#) and coordinated closely before IGF 2016. Over the course of the year, DCs have made significant progress toward synchronising their work and adopting fundamental [common standards of transparency and inclusiveness](#) (open archives, open membership, open mailing lists), and have developed agreed-upon targets and deadlines for the publication of [substantive papers](#). They have also jointly participated for the second time in a [survey exercise](#) to gather feedback on their papers. While there are currently 16 DCs, the community of DCs is also growing: two new coalitions, on ‘Community Connectivity’ and on ‘Innovative Approaches to Connecting the Unconnected’, emerged in 2016. Several more have recommitted to their activities, notably the coalitions on Internet and Climate Change and the Youth Coalition. Other groups, on defining “publicness” in the digital age and on schools on Internet governance, are in an exploratory phase and have expressed interest in launching DCs of their own.
- The participation of Governments and policymakers has increased significantly this year, with far more open forum sessions held than in any previous IGF. **Organizers of these 32 open forums** – a session type traditionally reserved for governments, IGOs and relevant international organizations – **included the Governments of China, Cuba, Egypt, Germany, Indonesia, Japan and Mexico, as well as the African Union, European Commission, Organization of American States (OAS), and OECD**. A delegation of 12 members of the **European Parliament**, the largest ever to come to an IGF, was also in attendance.
- The IGF brought together a number of **UN and intergovernmental organizations** as organizers of Day 0 events, open forums, and workshops. Over the course of the week, WIPO, which actively participated in the meeting this year, the ITU, UNESCO, the office of the UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Expression, the World Bank, and the OECD all held or co-organized sessions. As an indicator of the expanding relevance of Internet governance in diverse policy areas, for the first time UN Women and UNICEF also organized IGF events - on SDG 5 and the use of ICTs by women, and children’s rights research, respectively.
- WIPO’s participation in the 11th IGF again demonstrated the numerous areas of convergence between **intellectual property (IP)** and Internet governance. A balanced and well-functioning IP system contributes to inclusive and sustainable growth on the Internet by providing guarantees and incentives for innovation to take place and for creators to flourish.
- The **World Economic Forum (WEF)** made significant contributions to the meeting. It participated in a Main Session on the IGF’s intersessional activities, and held both a Day 0 event and open forum on connectivity, which brought in a number of partners including the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (**IEEE**), **Global Connect**, and the **Alliance for Affordable Internet**, as part of its ongoing Internet for All initiative.
- In order to help orient first-time participants to the IGF and to help them understand the organizational processes, as well as to foster their integration into the IGF community, a set of continuous activities throughout the 2016 programme was developed under the **Newcomers Track** by the MAG and the IGF Secretariat. Communication with new IGF participants will be continued intersessionally through a dedicated IGF newcomers mailing list.
- For the first time in the IGF workshop proposal process, proposers this year were invited to define their workshops with thematic tags, including write-in tags of their own choosing. As part of an approach to structuring the programme in a bottom-up way, the most popular tags

were used to determine the sub-themes for the 2016 meeting. This saw the inclusion of youth issues and sustainable development as new, discrete sub-themes. Although they did not constitute their own themes, tags on trade, digital literacy, and connecting the unconnected were also frequently used and were some of the most discussed issues in workshops.

- As an initiative of the MAG Working Group on New Session Formats, and with support from the Secretariat, the IGF this year introduced **new session types in the programme, including lightning and unconference sessions**. The experimental session formats provided an opportunity to engage with IGF participants, in particular young people, within settings that were informal and immensely lively. The 20-minute lightning sessions proved to be very popular. Held every day of the meeting during the lunch breaks, in a communal and central outdoor area of the venue, the sessions covered topics as varied as broadband affordability; Internet governance challenges in the Middle East and North Africa; the accountability of algorithms; and access to knowledge and culture online. High-scoring workshop proposals with compatible formats, which were not originally selected during the IGF 2016 workshop evaluation process, were re-formatted for the lightning sessions programme. Workshop proposers seized this opportunity enthusiastically and the 24 slots allocated to the lightning sessions were quickly filled. Unconference, in which participants proposed topics for presentation and discussion on a communal board, gave space to unplanned sessions on digital violence; African Internet rights; and free trade and Internet governance in Latin America.
- **The IGF Village** included a record number of booths, with having 40 exhibitors presenting, (double since last year); and gave exhibitors from across the stakeholder spectrum the opportunity to advance their work, network and create partnerships among the IGF's participants.

Opening Ceremony and Opening Session

“Indeed, the Internet and information and communication technologies (ICTs) can play an important, enabling role in our efforts to fulfill the great promise of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development,” stated United Nations Assistant Secretary-General Lenni Montiel in a message from UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon at the opening ceremony of the Forum. Noting that ICTs can deliver smart solutions to address climate change, hunger, poverty, women’s empowerment and more, the Secretary-General’s statement urged delegates to keep working to ensure universal access to a more open information society.

Ensuring equitable access is one of the main challenges of modern society, said Miguel Ruiz Cabañas, Undersecretary for Multilateral Affairs and Human Rights at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Mexico, who added his strong support for the 17 SDGs. “We are truly pleased that this event will foster the enabling of sustainable and inclusive growth and fight climate change with cross-cutting policies that contribute to access and use of the Internet.”

Alejandra Lagunes, Coordinator of the National Digital Strategy of Mexico and Chairperson of the 2016 IGF, said, “Clearly we need to build on our points of agreement and exchange of ideas so that we can make the most of all of the potential of the Internet.”

Local authorities and other speakers at the opening ceremony echoed the call for an open and universally accessible Internet while emphasizing the importance of net neutrality and more international coordination on cybersecurity issues. As this year’s IGF is the first since its 10-year

renewal decided by the General Assembly in 2015, speakers emphasized the importance of the IGF multistakeholder platform for public policy dialogue.

Main Sessions

• DAY One •

Assessing the Role of Internet Governance in the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

In September 2015, UN Member States and the United Nations General Assembly adopted a set of goals to end poverty, protect the planet, and ensure prosperity for all as part of a new sustainable development agenda. The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development established the global framework for development, building on the earlier Millennium Development Goals. The SDGs offer a broad and inclusive agenda that addresses economic, social, and environmental challenges in both developed and developing countries.

The Main Session on Assessing the Role of Internet Governance in the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) was timely in the sense that it took place in the first year that the global community began implementing the Agenda for Sustainable Development.

The need to enable the SDG goals and targets to become real and lasting tools for change was stressed by UN Assistant Secretary-General Lenni Montiel, who also noted that the Internet and ICTs provide reasons for being immensely optimistic about the Internet governance community's ability to support and enable sustainable development.

Various panelists noted the importance of transparent and inclusive multistakeholder approaches to sustainable development; including the significant role that the IGF can continue to play in facilitating debates with diverse stakeholders, including stakeholders from the development community, on supporting the 17 SDGs. The need to specifically address the challenges women, the youth, the elderly, and disabled people face in respect of sustainable development was also emphasised. Panelists noted that in ensuring that the Internet and other ICTs do in fact support sustainable development, it remains vital to put people first, not technology.

• DAY Two •

Sustainable Development, Internet and Inclusive Growth

In the context of the 2030 agenda and drawing on the 2016 IGF theme 'enabling inclusive and sustainable growth', the session built on the 2015 main session on Internet economy and sustainable development and promoted the responsible use of the Internet without leaving anybody behind. Three major themes - inclusion, capacity-building and content - were discussed. In his opening remarks United Nations Assistant-Secretary-General for Economic Development Mr. Lenni Montiel called upon the IGF community to play its important role: all three pillars of the SDGs need the Internet.

Connecting women, youth and disabled people is important, but the real target is to empower people, bring them into the Internet governance processes and ultimately give them ownership of their Internet.

Only a holistic approach to capacity building - giving access alone is not sufficient - can fully embrace the opportunities created by the changing technologies. All stakeholders need to keep an open mind, cooperate and create partnerships to invest in capacities on the demand and supply side. Trust is an important factor as is an enlightened regulatory and policy environment.

Local relevant content is content as well as services relevant for local users. More local content and more active services lead to more users and growth of the Internet. The creation of relevant local content, content in the local language and the development of the skills to put content online and develop online services require investments, but also create opportunities to earn money, for example when local content and services become globally available. Governments bear a crucial responsibility as they can act as facilitators or obstacles.

National and Regional IGFs (NRIs)

For the first time, the NRIs organized a main session where IGF initiatives, from 41 different countries and regions, including three Youth IGFs representatives, were individually represented. The main objective of this session was to raise the visibility of IGF initiatives, and to illustrate the substantive differences that exist across countries and regions with regards to Internet governance related issues.

The session was divided into two segments. The first part aimed at showcasing the different perspectives and approaches on the similar, substantive, Internet governance broader issues. The topics for discussion were: access and enhancing opportunities for the unconnected and under-connected, and secure, resilient and trusted Internet from the NRIs' perspectives. The second segment discussed the main challenges the NRIs are facing in their work. The session clearly illustrated that issues and challenges faced by the NRIs are different across countries and regions; further illustrating the importance of increased engagement between the IGF community and the NRIs.

• DAY Three •

Connecting Human Rights: Emphasizing Economic, Social and Cultural Rights on the Internet

The Main Session on Human Rights reflected on the importance of civil and political rights such as freedom of expression and the right to privacy, and stressed the importance of paying closer attention to the policy and governance implications of economic, social and cultural rights (ESCRs). The session focused on three major dimensions of discussion, namely civil and political rights; economic, social and cultural rights; and the ways in which these different rights are inherently related. Moderators introduced the overall framing for the session, and actively engaged discussants and participants on the interconnection between civil and political rights on one hand, and economic, social and cultural rights on the other.

Topics like privacy and big data; the Internet of Things; dealing with radicalised expression; the importance of addressing online abuse and gender-based violence; surveillance; the need for improved digital literacy efforts; the importance of freedom of expression for discriminated people such as on the basis of sexuality; counter speech; access to critical information and education with a link to Internet access and shutdowns; were all discussed. Various stakeholders stressed the importance of a multistakeholder approach to addressing these and other challenges pertaining to human rights online.

The Session demonstrated that there are a variety of ways to engage on ESCRs and other human rights and that the IGF is becoming an increasingly important platform to discuss these broad issues, what policy actions are needed, and how the IGF community can help to ensure that the Internet is used to enable sustainable development and to promote human rights globally.

IGF Dynamic Coalitions (DCs)

Dynamic coalitions (DCs) are historical IGF entities - grassroots, multistakeholder groups, the first of which emerged in 2006 at the Athens IGF, and in which individuals and organizations come together

around particular issues. Traditionally defined by their independent nature and internal procedures, a process to coordinate DCs and better integrate them into the main IGF programme has taken place. In 2015, DCs held a main session together for the first time. Building on that success, they agreed to come together again at IGF 2016 to demonstrate the value of their work and engage with meeting participants face-to-face.

DCs' closer collaboration was evident on the main stage at IGF 2016. Conscious of the need to both provide an overview of their activities and give each coalition equal space and voice - all while making their main session interesting to participants - coalitions devised a format in which each of their speakers would be questioned by a moderator in a challenging way. Acting as an "agent provocateur" and moving freely around the panel of DC speakers seated on the stage, the moderator prompted DCs into a defense or explanation of the ideas and assumptions in their work. True to the spirit of coalitions, this unexpected structure brought dynamism to the session and helped to highlight the varied issues covered by the 12 participating DCs: Accessibility and Disability; Blockchain Technologies; Child Online Safety; Community Connectivity; Core Internet Values; Gender and Internet Governance; Innovative Approaches to Connecting the Unconnected; Internet and Climate Change; Internet of Things; Network Neutrality; Public Access in Libraries and Internet Rights and Principles. Equally important, the sequence of questions served to emphasize the synergies and areas of potential collaboration among coalitions.

Although DCs carry out a range of activities and produce outputs independently, they also make important contributions to annual IGF meetings. The main session reminded participants of the improvements made to annual IGFs by Dynamic Coalition on Accessibility and Disability (DCAD)'s guidelines for accessibility and the DC on Gender and Internet Governance's "IGF Gender Report Card", which helps ensure equitable gender representation at IGFs.

Trade Policy and the Internet

For the first time, a main session was held on Trade Policy and the Internet which reflected the growing importance of trade issues, including domain name dispute resolution and access to registrant data, the use of encryption standards and source code disclosure mandates, and cross-border information flows. The session complemented the ongoing dialogues taking place in fora such as the WTO and in trade agreements such as the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP), Trade in Services Agreement (TISA), Trans-Atlantic Trade and Investment Partnership (TTIP), and Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP).

It was emphasized that there is a need to ensure that discussions on trade policy are not isolated from broader multistakeholder discussions of those same topics. In particular, because national trade ministries and trade negotiators do not always perceive these as being Internet governance issues, but view them simply as trade issues.

Many speakers emphasized that trade agreements have a history of involving governments, citizens and private sector actors in actions which can be beneficial to the economy in wider perspective but may result in harming a few fundamental core values, principles and rights for the Internet. Openness and transparency in trade agreements is needed with civil society actors participating in these debates. Governments and those in the private sector realize that trade agreements need to involve a dialogue with civil society. At the same time; however, it was noted that negotiations with government experts are often facilitated through specialized spaces which may not always be accessible to the general public.

• DAY Four •

IGF Best Practice Forums (BPFs) and Policy Options for Connecting the Next Billion(s)

This session presented the outputs of the 2016 IGF stakeholder-driven Best Practice Forums (BPFs) on IXPs, IPv6, Gender and Access, and Cybersecurity, and showcased the outcome of Phase II of the IGF Policy Options for Connecting the Next Billion(s) work. The session highlighted that these community activities have resulted in tangible resources from which policymakers can draw when addressing Internet policy issues. The session also gathered important community suggestions and feedback as to how these outputs may be taken forward into other relevant Internet governance fora and how the IGF community intersessional work could be enhanced looking ahead to 2017 and beyond.

Shaping the Future of Internet Governance: An Open Dialogue between Pioneers and Young Leaders

This main session was designed to provoke a conversation between different generations about the state of art of the Internet Ecosystem, proposing a future agenda for this environment. Newcomers and younger generations engaged in a dynamic dialogue with historical Internet actors debating Internet Governance challenges and nurturing an exchange of experiences and different ideas on various issues before the Internet community.

Taking Stock: Emerging Issues - Future of the IGF and IGF Retreat Consultation

The traditional 'Taking Stock' session held in the afternoon of the last day allowed all participants in an open microphone format to reflect upon their experience at the IGF annual meeting; raise emerging issues that they wanted the IGF to address in 2017 and suggest ways for the IGF to improve overall moving forward. This year the taking stock session also sought out further consultation from the community on the proceedings, ideas and suggestions from the IGF Retreat held in July 2016. The [proceedings document](#) is available for public review on the IGF website.